



McChesney, Gerry <gerry_mcchesney@fws.gov>

Peer reviews on your salamander report

1 message

McChesney, Gerry <gerry_mcchesney@fws.gov>
To: Gary Witmer <gary.w.witmer@aphis.usda.gov>

Tue, Mar 27, 2018 at 5:09 PM

Hi Gary,

I have three reviews of your report from: Barnett Rattner, Gregg Howald, and Bethany Kunz (USGS). Those reviews are attached.

Also, Vance Vredenburg just responded to my request for a review late last week, so I sent him a copy. He said he could review within a few days. Getting Vance's comments would be beneficial especially regarding capture methodology, housing, input on Results based on his salamander expertise, and having him check acknowledgements for his part of the study. I'll send that as soon as I have it.

Barnett commented separately that you are welcome to contact him if you have any questions about his comments.

The reviews provide some excellent suggestions for improving the report. You'll see there is some overlap in suggested changes. Here are a few that I would especially like to see addressed:

- Dr. Rattner provided some good suggestions on improving the summary and analyses of salamander weight change;
- Addressing the cricket mortality issue. This may need a separate section to summarize.
- "Hazard" vs "risk": clarify based on Dr. Rattner's comments.
- In the Methods, describe how much rodenticide was placed in cages and how much was sprinkled on crickets.
- I also noticed that cricket consumption per salamander is not in the Appendix. Given the attention to cricket consumption, that would be beneficial to have.
- A short Conclusions section would also be beneficial, including information on what the study told us and what it didn't tell us.

When you send the revised report, please include a summary of how you addressed comments.

Please let me know if you would like to discuss the reviews. Thank you for your efforts and I look forward to the revised report.

Gerry

Gerry McChesney
Manager, Farallon Islands National Wildlife Refuge and
Common Murre Restoration Project
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
San Francisco Bay National Wildlife Refuge Complex
1 Marshlands Road
Fremont, CA 94555
Phone: 510-792-0222, ext. 222, cell: 510-435-9151
Email: Gerry_McChesney@fws.gov
https://www.fws.gov/refuge/farallon_islands/
<http://www.fws.gov/sfbayrefuges/murre/murrehome.htm>
Follow us on Facebook!

4 attachments

Review of Draft Final Report QA-2688.docx
16K

An assessment of the potential hazards of anticoagulant rodenticides to salamander BAR 302118.docx
38K

3/28/2018

DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR Mail - Peer reviews on your salamander report



Howald Review for FINWR March 2018.docx

1322K



Howald additional comments.docx

14K