

**From:** [Margaret Kolar](#)  
**To:** [Gerry McChesney](#); [John Bradley](#); [Mendel Stewart](#)  
**Subject:** Fw: Thoughts on island eradication from Ellen Paul of Ornithological Council (1 of 2)  
**Date:** 06/08/2011 03:23 PM

---

fyi

---

Marge Kolar, Assistant Regional Director, NWRS  
Pacific Southwest Region  
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service  
2800 Cottage Way, W-2606  
Sacramento, California 95825  
Voice: (916) 414-6476  
Fax: (916) 414-6486

----- Forwarded by Margaret Kolar/SAC/R1/FWS/DOI on 06/08/2011 03:23 PM -----

**Mike  
Boylan/R7/FWS/DOI**

To Margaret Kolar/SAC/R1/FWS/DOI@FWS  
cc

06/08/2011 01:21 PM

Subject Thoughts on island eradication from Ellen Paul of  
Ornithological Council (1 of 2)

Hi, Marge:

We're negotiating with Alaska Dept. of Env. Conservation (pesticides, air & water, etc.) over Rat Is.

The Ornithological Council (OC) report we contracted for Rat Is. included 170 emails and numerous interviews and they've agreed to supply them.

As part of our discussion, Ellen Paul of the OC (birder and attorney) offered this para.

I asked Ellen if she'd OK me sharing her thoughts w/others (e.g. you) and she agreed and sent me another message, which I'll forward.

She also said you could contact her any time (well, not exatly any time; she's on East Coast time so 3 hour difference).

Anyway, hope this and the next email from Ellen are food for thought; her and the OC are a good resource.

"I just wish someone would tell the other regions to put eradication plans on hold unless and until IC and others do as we recommended, and as they agreed was warranted, which is to develop best practices. I hear they are planning to do an aerial broadcast of brodifacoum in the Farallons. As best I can tell from the description of the location, size, and terrain of these islands, they don't need to do aerial and there is no justification for brodifacoum. These islands are much like their trials on the San Jorge Islands - small (total of 0.41 km<sup>2</sup>), easy to reach, and even a set of buildings where they can store bait and equipment and perhaps stay. In the San Jorge Islands, they actually found that diphacinone worked better than brodifacoum. I am getting the sense - as apparently have others - that they are so terrified of failure (no one will hire us again) that they are unwilling to consider anything other than aerial baiting using very large quantities of bait. Other organizations, perhaps not driven by the need for a revenue stream, seem willing to use far less bait (as on South Georgia just recently). IC will tell you that they can't key the bait quantity to the rat density (in response to

our comment that they used far more bait than did the NZ group on Campbell, which had a much higher rat density) but that is in fact what was done on South Georgia..."

Ellen

Ellen Paul

Executive Director

The Ornithological Council

Email: [ellen.paul@verizon.net](mailto:ellen.paul@verizon.net)

Phone (301) 986 8568

"Providing Scientific Information about Birds"

<http://www.nmnh.si.edu/BIRDNET>