

**From:** [Halstead, Brian J](#)  
**To:** [McChesney, Gerry](#)  
**Subject:** Re: Request for peer review  
**Date:** Wednesday, April 24, 2013 10:38:35 PM  
**Attachments:** [Western Gull PVA BJH Comments.docx](#)  
[PRBO Impacts of House Mouse on Ashy Storm Petrels Farallones Oct 2012 BJH Comments.pdf](#)  
**Importance:** High

---

Hi Gerry,

I have completed my review of the reports, and found them both to be interesting and well-done. One of my reviews is embedded in the pdf, and the other is attached as a Word document (the pdf was saved in archive format, so I couldn't insert comments). Most of my comments were for clarification of assumptions or questions about whether specific assumptions were met (usually posed as questions because while I am familiar with the models, I am not a seabird expert). Please let me know if you have any questions regarding my review.

Best,

Brian

On Thu, Apr 4, 2013 at 9:40 AM, McChesney, Gerry <[gerry\\_mcchesney@fws.gov](mailto:gerry_mcchesney@fws.gov)> wrote:

Hi Brian,

Excellent! Here they are. How about a due date of April 25. While I would appreciate comments on any aspect of the reports, we particularly need comments on:

- 1) Were the analyses used appropriate;
- 2) Were assumptions included in the models appropriate, given available information;
- 3) Were interpretations of the results appropriate?

Please include suggestions for improvement.

Thank you!

Gerry

On Thu, Apr 4, 2013 at 9:19 AM, Halstead, Brian <[bhalstead@usgs.gov](mailto:bhalstead@usgs.gov)> wrote:

Hi Gerry,

I am happy to review these reports for you, and I should be able to turn them around within three weeks.

Thanks,

Brian

On Wed, Apr 3, 2013 at 2:42 PM, McChesney, Gerry <[gerry\\_mcchesney@fws.gov](mailto:gerry_mcchesney@fws.gov)> wrote:

Dear Brian,

Julie Yee suggested you. I am looking for peer reviewers for two reports that are being used as Decision Support Tools for a Draft Environmental Impact Statement assessing alternatives to eradicate invasive house mice from the Farallon Islands, California. Both reports were done by PRBO Conservation Science.

1) One report is titled "Population Viability Analysis of Western Gulls on the Farallon Islands In Relation to Potential Mortality Due To Proposed House Mouse Eradication," by Nadav Nur et al. This report is 31 pages long, including tables and figures.

2) The other report is titled "Modeling The Impacts Of House Mouse Eradication On Ashy Storm-Petrels On Southeast Farallon Island," also by Nadav Nur et al. This report is 41 pages long, including tables and figures (about 25 pp. of text).

I'm wondering if you would be willing to provide a review of either one or both of these reports? I would need comments within about three weeks. If so, I will email you the report(s). If you cannot review within three weeks but would still be willing to provide a review, how much time would you need? Please let me know if you have any questions.

Thanks very much.

Gerry

---

Gerry McChesney  
Manager, Farallon National Wildlife Refuge and  
Common Murre Restoration Project  
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service  
San Francisco Bay National Wildlife Refuge Complex  
1 Marshlands Road  
Fremont, CA 94555  
Phone: 510-792-0222, ext. 222, cell: 510-435-9151  
Fax: 510-745-9285  
Email: [Gerry\\_McChesney@fws.gov](mailto:Gerry_McChesney@fws.gov)  
<http://www.fws.gov/sfbayrefuges/murre/murrehome.htm>  
<http://www.fws.gov/sfbayrefuges/Farallon/>

---

--

\*\*\* NOTE NEW ADDRESS \*\*\*

Brian J. Halstead, Ph.D.  
Wildlife Biologist  
U.S. Geological Survey  
Western Ecological Research Center  
Dixon Field Station  
800 Business Park Drive, Suite D  
Dixon, CA 95620-4309  
ph: 530-669-5076

fax: 707-678-5039  
[bhalstead@usgs.gov](mailto:bhalstead@usgs.gov)

--  
Gerry

---

Gerry McChesney  
Manager, Farallon National Wildlife Refuge and  
Common Murre Restoration Project  
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service  
San Francisco Bay National Wildlife Refuge Complex  
1 Marshlands Road  
Fremont, CA 94555  
Phone: 510-792-0222, ext. 222, cell: 510-435-9151  
Fax: 510-745-9285  
Email: [Gerry\\_McChesney@fws.gov](mailto:Gerry_McChesney@fws.gov)  
<http://www.fws.gov/sfbayrefuges/murre/murrehome.htm>  
<http://www.fws.gov/sfbayrefuges/Farallon/>

---

--  
\*\*\* NOTE NEW ADDRESS \*\*\*

Brian J. Halstead, Ph.D.  
Wildlife Biologist  
U.S. Geological Survey  
Western Ecological Research Center  
Dixon Field Station  
800 Business Park Drive, Suite D  
Dixon, CA 95620-4309  
ph: 530-669-5076  
fax: 707-678-5039  
[bhalstead@usgs.gov](mailto:bhalstead@usgs.gov)